

**MARK SCHEME for the October/November 2009 question paper  
for the guidance of teachers**

**9708 ECONOMICS**

**9708/41**

Paper 41 (Data Response and Essays – Supplement),  
maximum raw mark 70

This mark scheme is published as an aid to teachers and candidates, to indicate the requirements of the examination. It shows the basis on which Examiners were instructed to award marks. It does not indicate the details of the discussions that took place at an Examiners' meeting before marking began, which would have considered the acceptability of alternative answers.

Mark schemes must be read in conjunction with the question papers and the report on the examination.

- CIE will not enter into discussions or correspondence in connection with these mark schemes.

CIE is publishing the mark schemes for the October/November 2009 question papers for most IGCSE, GCE Advanced Level and Advanced Subsidiary Level syllabuses and some Ordinary Level syllabuses.



<b>Page 2</b>	<b>Mark Scheme: Teachers' version</b>	<b>Syllabus</b>	<b>Paper</b>
	<b>GCE A LEVEL – October/November 2009</b>	<b>9708</b>	<b>41</b>

### Section A

- 1 (a) Explanation of increase in production in manufacturing and reduction in significance of agriculture with consequent effect on GDP. [2]
- (b) The forests will be lost, people will lose their existing homes, the wildlife will suffer, the rivers will be contaminated, there will be air pollution and acid-rain, not everyone will be employed in the factory but the farm land will be destroyed. These changes could be given a monetary value and the effect on the whole economy given an economic cost. [5]
- (c) They will not be dependent on rain so there will be constant work, they are likely to become more skilled – there is college training, the product produced is worth more so their value is higher. So, if they get a job their income is likely to be higher. But they have been displaced from their home and their community. The factory is not labour intensive and not everyone who has been displaced will be employed; supply of labour is high which will could depress wages. The overall balance will vary according to the individual concerned. One side only maximum 3. [5]
- (d) Evidence for: 48% poverty, low literacy, high debts, disease, hunger, floods. Against this there has been some industrialisation, improved employment, use of natural resources, steel production, increased incomes. Need better figures of comparative living standards before and after development in the area, comparisons with other states, other information which is usually included in standard of living comparisons involving social and economic indicators. [8]

<b>Page 3</b>	<b>Mark Scheme: Teachers' version</b>	<b>Syllabus</b>	<b>Paper</b>
	<b>GCE A LEVEL – October/November 2009</b>	<b>9708</b>	<b>41</b>

## Section B

### General Comments for section B:

The essay questions carry a maximum mark of 25. Try not to 'bunch' marks, but use the whole mark range. If there is any doubt in your mind, give the benefit of doubt to the candidate.

The difference in grades should be assessed on the ability of the candidate to demonstrate the various objectives of the examination listed in the syllabus and not purely on the ability to itemise further facts from the content of the syllabus. Marks should be awarded for the ability to demonstrate that aim b) of the syllabus has been achieved as well as aim a) - which refers to content knowledge. It is the objective of the examination, as listed in the syllabus, to assess both these aims.

An overall guide for marks for individual questions is given below; these are from a total of 25. They may be applied proportionally of course to parts of questions where the total is less than 25:

### Mark 1–9 (Linked to level one in individual question notes)

- 1–5 where the answer is mostly irrelevant and only contains a few valid points made incidentally in an irrelevant context. There will also be substantial omissions of analysis.
- 6–9 where the answer shows some knowledge but does not indicate that the meaning of the question has been properly grasped. Basic errors of theory, or an inadequate development of analysis may be evident.

### Mark 10–13 (Linked to level two in individual question notes)

- 10–11 where there is evidence of an ability to identify facts or some ability at graphs and/or a fair ability to apply known laws to new situations.  
There should be an accurate although undeveloped explanation of the facts relating to the question together with an explanation of the theory, and evidence of some ability to discriminate and form elementary judgements. Do not expect a clear logical presentation. There will not be much evidence of the ability to recognise unstated assumptions, nor to examine the implications of a hypothesis, nor of the ability to organize ideas into a new unity.
- 12–13 where the answer has a more thorough relevance to the question but where the theory is incompletely explained.

### Mark 14–17 (Linked to level 3 in individual question notes)

- 14–15 where there is a good knowledge of the facts and theory of the question, clear evidence of the ability to use the facts and theory with accurate reference to the question that may have presented the candidate with a novel application.  
There should also be evidence, where appropriate, of the ability to examine the implications of the question and an attempt to distinguish between facts and value judgements.  
Clear statements, supported by reasoned arguments should be given and there should be some attempt at a conclusion to the question. There should be a reasoned structure to the whole answer. Do not expect too many extra illustrative points which are not explicitly referred to in the question, do not expect too much critical comment on unstated assumptions.
- 16–17 for an answer showing a well reasoned understanding of the question's requirements and of the relevant theory: the analysis should be sound though the illustration and development may not be very full.

<b>Page 4</b>	<b>Mark Scheme: Teachers' version</b>	<b>Syllabus</b>	<b>Paper</b>
	<b>GCE A LEVEL – October/November 2009</b>	<b>9708</b>	<b>41</b>

**Mark 18–25 (Linked to level 4 in individual question notes)**

18–20 where there is a thorough knowledge of the facts and theory with an excellent ability to describe, explain or analyse this in a precise, logical, reasoned manner. There should be an ability to query some of the assumptions in the question and clear evidence of an ability to distinguish between fact and value judgements and to draw some conclusions on the matter being discussed. Conclusions should be formed and expressed within a sound structured answer so that the whole is well presented. New illustrations and apposite examples should be introduced as further evidence of an ability to recognise the principles of the question and their application to relevant current situations.

21–25 for an answer which, given the time constraint, could not be improved significantly: it will have clear analysis, ample illustration and a good attempt at considered evaluation.

Be positive in your marking awarding marks for what is there without being too much influenced by omissions. Marks should not be deleted for inaccuracies.

Corresponding marks for sub-sections.

	<b>1</b>	<b>2</b>	<b>3</b>	<b>4</b>
<b>Total mark 10</b>	1–3	4–5	6–7	8–10
<b>Total mark 12</b>	1–4	5–6	7–8	9–12
<b>Total mark 13</b>	1–4+	5–6+	7–8+	9–13
<b>Total mark 15</b>	1–5	6–8	9–11	12–15

**2** *Explanation of meaning of efficient allocation and explanation of the analysis which ensures an efficient optimum may be reached. Distinction between productive and allocative efficiency. Discussion of reasons for market failure and necessity/desirability of government intervention to achieve efficiency.*

L4 For a thorough explanation and a reasoned discussion dealing with both aspects of efficiency and possible reasons for government intervention. [18–25]

L3 For a competent explanation of terms with accurate but limited discussion. [14–17]

L2 For a correct but undeveloped explanation with some attempt at analysis but only brief discussion. [10–13]

L1 For an answer which shows some knowledge but does not indicate that the question has been fully grasped, or where the answer is mostly irrelevant. [1–9]

<b>Page 5</b>	<b>Mark Scheme: Teachers' version</b>	<b>Syllabus</b>	<b>Paper</b>
	<b>GCE A LEVEL – October/November 2009</b>	<b>9708</b>	<b>41</b>

**3 (a)** *Explanation of economies of scale suggesting which of the economies might be significant in a public utility industry.*

L4 For a sound explanation of each the different economies and a clear link to the industry mentioned. [9–12]

L3 For a competent explanation of economies of scale but with limited application. [7–8]

L2 For a correct but limited explanation and little or no application. [5–6]

L1 For an answer which has some basic correct facts but includes irrelevancies. Errors of theory or omissions of analysis will be substantial. [1–4]

**(b)** *Discussion of the meaning of contestable markets and a consideration of what competition might be likely in the market for gas. Substitute alternative energy sources should be mentioned.*

L4 For a reasoned and well argued discussion with accurate development of the analysis and a good application. [9–13]

L3 For a clear but undeveloped discussion but one which still tries to make an application. [7–8]

L2 For a limited attempt to consider the theory but with little application. [5–6]

L1 For an answer which has some basic correct facts but includes irrelevancies. Errors of theory or omissions of analysis are substantial. [1–4]

**4** *Discussion of determinants of wage rates using either demand and supply or marginal revenue productivity. In the past we have not used the full range of marks for a demand and supply approach only with no mention of marginal revenue productivity. This question does refer to public and private sectors so the influence of government in determining wage rates could be mentioned although the actual question does not ask for a comparison.*

L4 For a thorough explanation of the analysis of wage determination with a clear link to the explanation of low wages with discussion of institutional factors and government policy. [18–25] (14–17 for demand and supply only with institutional factors and government policy.)

L3 For a competent explanation but with limited discussion and application. [14–17] (10–13 for demand and supply.)

L2 For a correct but undeveloped explanation with only brief application. [10–13] (6–9 for demand and supply.)

L1 For an answer which contains inaccuracies and only a few correct points. [1–9] (1–5 for demand and supply only.)

<b>Page 6</b>	<b>Mark Scheme: Teachers' version</b>	<b>Syllabus</b>	<b>Paper</b>
	<b>GCE A LEVEL – October/November 2009</b>	<b>9708</b>	<b>41</b>

- 5 (a) *Explanation of the link between interest and growth which is usually through lower rates causing increased investment or spending and subsequent multiplier effects on the national income.*
- L4 For a sound explanation of the meaning of growth and of the link between interest and growth and explicit reference to the contradiction. [9–12]
- L3 For a competent explanation of growth but with a limited attempt to see the contradiction implied or a sound explanation with no attempt to see the contradiction. [7–8]
- L2 For a correct but weak explanation of growth. [5–6]
- L1 For an answer which has some basic correct facts but includes irrelevancies. Errors of theory or omissions of analysis will be substantial. [1–4]
- (b) *Discussion of the benefits of economic growth in terms of income, employment, standards of living but a consideration of the drawbacks in terms of externalities, short-term v. long-term use of resources, distribution of income and opportunity costs involved.*
- L4 For a reasoned and well argued discussion with accurate development of the analysis and a reasoned conclusion. [9–13]
- L3 For a clear but undeveloped discussion but one which still tries to make a conclusion. [7–8]
- L2 For a limited attempt to consider the theory but with no conclusion. [5–6]
- L1 For an answer which has some basic correct facts but includes irrelevancies. Errors of theory or omissions of analysis are substantial. [1–4]
- 6 *Question requires both a comment on the measurement of GNP – difficulties in collecting data, of unofficial economy, of double counting etc. – as well as a comment on the interpretation of the figures and the use to which they might be put when forming policy. Candidates should consider whether GNP figures can take some account of crime, pollution and health. Some of the alternative approaches which use GNP may include reference to part of the concerns stated. Candidates could also consider whether there is a link between GNP and crime or pollution or health.*
- L4 For a thorough explanation of the difficulties of measuring GNP, an analysis of how GNP might be effectively used and a discussion of the link with the issues mentioned. Conclusion should refer to the proposition in the stimulus. [18–25]
- L3 For a competent explanation which does not fully analyse the difficulties of calculating or using GNP but makes some attempt at evaluation and tries to link the discussion to the issues raised. A brief conclusion will be stated. [14–17]
- L2 For an accurate though undeveloped explanation with some attempt at analysis but no real attempt to link to the issues stated. [10–13]
- L1 For an answer which shows some knowledge but does not indicate that the question has been fully grasped, or where the answer is mostly irrelevant [1–9]

<b>Page 7</b>	<b>Mark Scheme: Teachers' version</b>	<b>Syllabus</b>	<b>Paper</b>
	<b>GCE A LEVEL – October/November 2009</b>	<b>9708</b>	<b>41</b>

7 (a) *Explanation of the characteristic differences between a developing country and a developed country.*

L4 For a sound explanation and explicit comparison of the characteristics giving a good range of indicators both economic and social. [9–12]

L3 For a competent explanation but with a limited development, or a fuller development of only a few characteristics but still with an explicit comparison. [7–8]

L2 For a correct but weak explanation of the characteristics and little development. No explicit comparison given and reader is left to draw conclusions. [5–6]

L1 For an answer which has some basic correct facts but includes irrelevancies. Errors of theory or omissions of analysis will be substantial. [1–4]

(b) *Discussion of economic problems facing developed countries and a consideration of whether they are similar. Candidates could mention possible unemployment, possible pollution, possible inflation, possible over-crowding, negative externalities, exploitation of resources with lack of consideration for the long term.*

L4 For a reasoned and well argued discussion with accurate development of the discussion and a reasoned conclusion. [9–13]

L3 For a clear but undeveloped discussion but one which still tries to make a conclusion. [7–8]

L2 For a limited attempt to consider the theory but with no conclusion. [5–6]

L1 For an answer which has some basic correct facts but includes irrelevancies. Errors of theory or omissions of analysis are substantial. [1–4]