

MARK SCHEME for the October/November 2006 question paper

0470 HISTORY

0470/02

Paper 2, maximum raw mark 50

This mark scheme is published as an aid to teachers and students, to indicate the requirements of the examination. It shows the basis on which Examiners were instructed to award marks. It does not indicate the details of the discussions that took place at an Examiners' meeting before marking began.

All Examiners are instructed that alternative correct answers and unexpected approaches in candidates' scripts must be given marks that fairly reflect the relevant knowledge and skills demonstrated.

Mark schemes must be read in conjunction with the question papers and the report on the examination.

The grade thresholds for various grades are published in the report on the examination for most IGCSE, GCE Advanced Level and Advanced Subsidiary Level syllabuses.

- CIE will not enter into discussions or correspondence in connection with these mark schemes.

CIE is publishing the mark schemes for the October/November 2006 question papers for most IGCSE, GCE Advanced Level and Advanced Subsidiary Level syllabuses and some Ordinary Level syllabuses.



Page 2	Mark Scheme	Syllabus	Paper
	IGCSE - OCT/NOV 2006	0470	2

Twentieth Century Option

Q1 Study Sources A and B. How far do these agree? Explain your answer using the sources.

BBL	They agree because they are both history books, they are both about the Treaty of Versailles.	(0)
Level 1	Describes or summarises the content of the sources – no valid comparison.	(1)
Level 2	Gives details that are in one source but not in the other.	(2)
Level 3	Explains agreements e.g. the Treaty was harsh, it was bad, Germans did not like it.	(3-4)
Level 4	Explains disagreements e.g. Source A says the Treaty could have been worse, B says it was harsh.	(5-6)
Level 5	Agreement or disagreement plus a qualification.	(6)
Level 6	Explains agreement and disagreement (Levels 3 and 4).	(7)

Page 3	Mark Scheme	Syllabus	Paper
	IGCSE - OCT/NOV 2006	0470	2

Q2 Study Sources C and D. Does Source C make you surprised by what is shown in the cartoon (Source D)? Explain your answer using the sources and your knowledge.

Level 1	Compares sources but no surprise/unsupported assertions, copies the sources.	(1)
Level 2	Answers based on time – e.g. change of mind, different people involved – no contextual knowledge used.	(2)
Level 3	Ignores Source C and just writes about whether they are surprised by Source D.	(3)
Level 4	Surprised/not surprised because of surface comparison of differences/similarities – no contextual knowledge used.	(4)
Level 5	Compares Sources C and D and uses contextual knowledge about C or D to argue they are surprised.	(5-6)
Level 6	Compares Sources C and D and uses contextual knowledge about C or D to argue not surprised.	(7-8)

Page 4	Mark Scheme	Syllabus	Paper
	IGCSE - OCT/NOV 2006	0470	2

Q3 Study Sources E, F and G. Do you agree that these three sources prove that Lloyd George could not be trusted? Explain your answer using the sources and your knowledge.

- | | | |
|---------|--|-------|
| Level 1 | Unsupported assertions, copies or paraphrases the sources – they are not used together. | (1) |
| Level 2 | Uses internal evidence of individual sources to reach judgement, no contextual knowledge, sources not used together. Will most likely use Sources E or G. | (2) |
| Level 3 | Proper evaluation of sources to reach judgement but sources are not used together. | (3) |
| Level 4 | Argues that Lloyd George can be trusted – based on using the evidence in at least two sources together. | (4) |
| Level 5 | Argues that Lloyd George cannot be trusted – based on using the evidence in at least two sources together. | (5) |
| Level 6 | Uses evidence from at least two sources together and proper evaluation of at least one source to confirm judgement about trusting/not trusting Lloyd George. | (6-8) |

Page 5	Mark Scheme	Syllabus	Paper
	IGCSE - OCT/NOV 2006	0470	2

Q4 Study Source H. Do you think that President Wilson would have been happy with this welcome? Explain your answer using the sources and your knowledge.

- | | | |
|---------|---|-------|
| Level 1 | Answers that fit with the source but make little sense e.g. he had just got off the plane after a long journey so not happy, French suggest American soldiers were inexperienced. | (1) |
| Level 2 | He was happy because – American soldiers were being given some recognition, he was being shown around; not happy because it was a gloomy speech. | (2-3) |
| Level 3 | Both types of Level 2 – happy and not happy with support. | (3-4) |
| Level 4 | Answers based on the tone of the source – lecturing him, patronising him, telling him what to think. | (5) |
| Level 5 | Uses contextual knowledge or cross-reference to other sources to use Wilson’s hopes/aims to argue he would not be happy with what is said. | (6-7) |

Page 6	Mark Scheme	Syllabus	Paper
	IGCSE - OCT/NOV 2006	0470	2

Q5 Study Sources I and J. How similar are these two cartoons? Explain your answer using the sources and your knowledge.

Level 1	Both are British, different dates.	(1)
Level 2	Literal reading and comparison of details in the cartoons, e.g. Germany in/not in the water, asking for help/not asking for help.	(2)
Level 3	Interprets cartoons but no comparison, OR compares their messages but misinterprets one.	(4)
Level 4	Compares interpretations of cartoons – Germany is being punished in both, or Britain and France doing the punishing in I but all the Allies involved in J. The opinions of the cartoonists are not given.	(4-5)
Level 5	Explains that both cartoons are being critical of the treatment of Germany, or I is critical or approving and J is approving of the Treaty. The opinion of the cartoonist must be explicitly mentioned.	(5-6)
Level 6	Comparison of – I is criticising Germany or justifying the Treaty while J is criticising treatment of Germany or criticising the Treaty.	(7-8)

Page 7	Mark Scheme	Syllabus	Paper
	IGCSE - OCT/NOV 2006	0470	2

Q6 Study all the sources. How far do these sources show that peacemakers at Versailles wanted to treat Germany harshly? Use the sources to explain your answer.

Level 1	No valid source use.	(1-3)
Level 2	Uses the sources to support or reject the statement.	(4-6)
Level 3	Uses sources to support and reject the statement.	(7-10)

Up to 2 bonus marks can be awarded for any evaluation of the sources (no more than 1 per source)

Source use must be a reference to the source by letter, by provenance, or by a direct quote.

Use Y in the margin for each source support of the statement, and a N for each source rejection of the statement.

Page 8	Mark Scheme	Syllabus	Paper
	IGCSE - OCT/NOV 2006	0470	2

Nineteenth Century Option

Q1 Study Source A. Who does the author of this source think was responsible for the increasing tension between Britain and Germany? Explain your answer using the source.

- | | | |
|---------|--|-------|
| Level 1 | Copies, paraphrases sources, unsupported assertions e.g. it was Germany. | (1) |
| Level 2 | Explains it is Britain or Russia or Austria-Hungary. | (2) |
| Level 3 | Explains it is Germany. | (3-4) |
| Level 4 | Levels 2 and 3 e.g. it is both Britain and Germany. | (5) |
| Level 5 | Explains it is Germany – with a qualification. | (6) |

Page 9	Mark Scheme	Syllabus	Paper
	IGCSE - OCT/NOV 2006	0470	2

Q2 Study Sources B and C. Does Source C make you surprised by the message of the cartoon (Source B)? Explain your answer using the sources and your knowledge.

- | | | |
|---------|--|-------|
| Level 1 | Answers based on surface difference/similarities – no interpretation of the sources. | (1) |
| Level 2 | C is 10 years later so is not relevant – the sources are not connected to each other. | (2) |
| Level 3 | Ignores C, explains if surprised by B – must be a contextual explanation. | (3) |
| Level 4 | Argues B is aggressive, C is not, or used context/time to argue that B is not an adequate explanation while C is more complete. | (4-5) |
| Level 5 | Explains not surprised because both are supporting alliances because they prevent war, 5 marks for context free answers, 6-7 for contextual explanation. | (5-7) |
| Level 6 | Level 5 with a qualification. | (8) |

Page 10	Mark Scheme	Syllabus	Paper
	IGCSE - OCT/NOV 2006	0470	2

Q3 Study Sources D and E. These two sources are biased. Does this mean they cannot be believed? Explain your answer using the sources and your knowledge.

- | | | |
|---------|--|-------|
| Level 1 | Uncritical acceptance of statement, biased = cannot be believed. | (1) |
| Level 2 | Answers based on provenance – not developed, i.e. no use of content, OR identifies content that can/cannot be believed – no explanation. | (2-3) |
| Level 3 | Explains sources disagree (must explain how they disagree), so both cannot be believed. | (3) |
| Level 4 | The sources are only points of view so they are not right or wrong. | (4) |
| Level 5 | Checks sources by cross-reference. | (5-6) |
| Level 6 | Evaluates sources through their purpose – must use content of sources. | (7-8) |

Page 11	Mark Scheme	Syllabus	Paper
	IGCSE - OCT/NOV 2006	0470	2

Q4 Study Sources F and G. How similar are these two cartoons? Explain your answer using the sources and your knowledge.

Level 1	Literal readings of cartoons.	(1)
Level 2	Answers based on provenance of sources – not developed e.g. German/British, dates.	(2)
Level 3	They are about different things – Agadir/Balkans, OR they are both about crises.	(3)
Level 4	Interprets one cartoon or both but no valid comparison.	(4)
Level 5	Explains similarity or difference, based on interpretations.	(5-7)
Level 6	Explains similarity and difference – based on interpretations.	(8)

Page 12	Mark Scheme	Syllabus	Paper
	IGCSE - OCT/NOV 2006	0470	2

Q5 Study Sources H and I. Is one of these sources more reliable than the other? Explain your answer using the sources and your knowledge.

Level 1	Identifies content that is believed/not believed.	(1)
Level 2	Answers based on use of provenance, no use of content.	(2-3)
Level 3	They differ (explains differences) so one must be more reliable than the other.	(3)
Level 4	They are both points of view (explained) so one cannot be more reliable than the other or they are both reliable.	(4)
Level 5	Cross-reference to support/reject at least one source.	(5-6)
Level 6	Informed use of provenance and content to consider purpose to judge reliability.	(7-8)

Page 13	Mark Scheme	Syllabus	Paper
	IGCSE - OCT/NOV 2006	0470	2

Q6 Study all the sources. How far do these sources support the idea that the naval race was the major cause of the First World War? Use the sources to explain your answer.

Level 1	No valid source use.	(1-3)
Level 2	Uses the sources to support or reject the statement.	(4-6)
Level 3	Uses sources to support and reject the statement.	(7-10)

Up to 2 bonus marks can be awarded for any evaluation of the sources (no more than 1 per source)

Source use must be a reference to the source by letter, by provenance, or by a direct quote.

Use Y in the margin for each source support of the statement, and a N for each source rejection of the statement.